

Assessing Individual Performance in Visual Arts Group Projects

This document has been prepared as an introductory guide for teachers wishing to explore group assessment activities for visual arts achievement standards. In this context teachers need to consider how individual assessment decisions can be validly made for each student within the context of a single group outcome.

Key Questions:

Validity of assessment - Do students' grades in the group assessment accurately correlate to their grades in individual assessments for the same course?

Validity of learning context - Is this an activity that needs to be done as a group or could it just as easily be done as an individual project?

Group Project Advantages	Potential Group Project Risks
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Aligns well with Key Competencies of New Zealand Curriculum: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relating to others, Participating and contributing including: teamwork skills (leadership), Analytical and cognitive skills (evaluating work of others), Collaborative skills (negotiation, compromise, and flexibility), Managing self (organisational skills). Aligns with real world contexts of collaborative team work projects in the creative industries. Enriches learning experience. Engages social oriented students Uniquely suited to new .5 standards. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> It may be difficult to accurately assess each student's relative contribution. Student performance may not be truly representative. (It may be aided or impeded by others). Assessment may be seen as unfair where students resent inequity of individual contribution. (Non participating students seen as 'free riders'). Can become source of conflict and disengagement. (Where interpersonal relationships are poorly managed). Negative past experiences of poorly managed group projects may create pre-existing resistance to the group context.

Sample Approach	Pedagogy Advantages	Pedagogy Risks
<p>Part One – Individual research, drawing, media techniques and planning exercises.</p> <p>Part Two – Group negotiation of final plan and completion of collaborative work.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Motivates all students to contribute. Opportunity for students to develop transferable interpersonal skills. Encourages involvement, accountability, and sense of responsibility to and for others. Students monitor each others contributions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Students may not have the necessary skills needed for negotiation with the final design selected on popularity rather than merit. May lead to conflict that students are unable to manage. Workload may increase with evaluation templates required.
<p>Final grade awarded for finished work which is then individually modified based on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Individual evidence from part one Teacher observation Self evaluation Peer evaluation 	<h3>Assessment Advantages</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Perceived as fairer than single shared mark regardless of individual contribution. Potential reward for higher levels of performance. Strong student consciousness of assessment criteria and learning outcomes. May assist students develop skills of appraisal and independent judgement. 	<h3>Assessment Risks</h3> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Peer evaluation may be subjective or inaccurate. This could also be perceived by students as being unfair. Limited weighting for peer evaluations. Self evaluation may be subjective or inaccurate. Influenced by low self esteem or egotism. Limited weighting for self evaluations. Teacher observation may be intermittent. Students will need assessment training.

Other issues:

- Rationale for group approach to project must be clear and convincing.
- Criteria for assessment (teacher, self, peer) and proportional weightings must be clear.
- System for group selection identified. May be teacher decided or self selected.
- Roles of group members may need clarifying. Will each group have an official leader?
- Can individuals choose to opt out of the group approach and do an individual project?

Individual Assessment Matrix for Achievement Standard 90917

Name:	Final Adjusted Grade:
-------	-----------------------

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
Produce a finished work that demonstrates skills appropriate to cultural conventions.	Produce a finished work that demonstrates control of skills appropriate to cultural conventions.	Produce a finished work that demonstrates fluent control of skills appropriate to cultural conventions.

The conventions and skills appropriate to the mural brief in this context include:

- Consideration of the relationship between the mural design and the physical space.
- The use of painting materials and techniques appropriate to large-scale works.
- A collaborative process through which students agree upon consistent thematic content and the alignment of individual contributions to the larger design.
- Subject matter is selected that is appropriate to the local context
- Client consultation, constraints, costs, time frames.

Evidence	Criteria	Comment	Grade
Part 2 Finished work	Group grade for finished work according to registered achievement criteria (including proximity to grade boundary)		
Part 1 Personal research and planning	Evidence shows knowledge of and is appropriate to identified cultural conventions		
Part 1 Personal skills	Depth and quality of conceptual ideas		
Part 1 Personal skills	Facility with technical skills with media		
Part 2 Self Evaluation (Limited weighting)	Level of participation and skills with media		
Part 2 Peer Evaluation (Limited weighting)	Level of participation and skills with media (Averaged score)		
Part 2 Teacher Observation Level of participation	Significance of student contribution to overall design and structure of finished work		
Part 2 Teacher Observation Conceptual and technical skills	Level of personal control with use of materials and techniques (appropriate, control, facility)		
Final Individual Grade	Comment:		

Final grades will be decided using professional judgement based on a holistic examination of the evidence (group outcome and individual contribution) provided against the criteria in the Achievement Standard.

Self and Peer Assessment Templates for Achievement Standard 90917

Your Name:	Date:
------------	-------

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
Produce a finished work that demonstrates skills appropriate to cultural conventions.	Produce a finished work that demonstrates control of skills appropriate to cultural conventions.	Produce a finished work that demonstrates fluent control of skills appropriate to cultural conventions.

How would you rate **your** participation in the group? (Circle one)

Very Involved	Involved	Usually involved	Less involved	Not involved
---------------	----------	------------------	---------------	--------------

- Very Involved – I felt responsible and did extra work to get it finished
- Involved – I did what was expected of me and contributed my fair share
- Usually involved – I was mostly on task and didn't distract the others
- Less Involved – I did some work but didn't really get into it
- Not involved – I didn't care about this project much and did very little work

How would you rate the quality of **your** work? (Circle one)

Fluent control	Control of skills	Some skills	Limited skills
----------------	-------------------	-------------	----------------

- Fluent control – consistently high level of skill in all areas of the project
- Control of skills – above average level of skill compared to most of the group
- Some skills – things worked out okay most of the time but not great
- Limited skills – my work is not as good as the others in the group

Name of another member of the group:				
How would you rate their participation in the group? (Circle one)				
Very Involved	Involved	Usually involved	Less involved	Not involved
How would you rate the quality of their work? (Circle one)				
Fluent control	Control of skills	Some skills	Limited skills	

Name of another member of the group:				
How would you rate their participation in the group? (Circle one)				
Very Involved	Involved	Usually involved	Less involved	Not involved
How would you rate the quality of their work? (Circle one)				
Fluent control	Control of skills	Some skills	Limited skills	

Name of another member of the group:				
How would you rate their participation in the group? (Circle one)				
Very Involved	Involved	Usually involved	Less involved	Not involved
How would you rate the quality of their work? (Circle one)				
Fluent control	Control of skills	Some skills	Limited skills	